

THROUGH A GLASS DARKELY

Richard Hayes Phillips, Ph.D.

A serious question has been raised as to how C. Ellen Connally, a little-known, underfunded, African-American municipal judge from Cleveland, running for Chief Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court against a well-financed incumbent, could have received more votes than John Kerry in 12 counties in Ohio. Not just a larger percentage of the vote. She drew more votes than John Kerry in these counties, in a race for Chief Justice that drew 1,195,882 fewer votes, statewide, than did the presidential race. The matter will be forever known, in the words of Reverend Jesse Jackson, as "The Connally Anomaly."

The 12 counties are: Auglaize, Brown, Butler, Clermont, Darke, Highland, Mercer, Miami, Putnam, Shelby, Van Wert, and Warren.

COMPARISON OF PRESIDENTIAL AND CHIEF JUSTICE RACES, 2004

County	Bush	Kerry	Moyer	Connally
Auglaize	17,016	5,903	11,795	7,545
Brown	12,647	7,140	8,562	7,498
Butler	109,872	56,243	68,407	61,559
Clermont	62,949	25,887	43,598	30,068
Darke	18,306	7,846	12,762	9,021
Highland	12,211	6,194	8,625	6,298
Mercer	15,650	5,118	9,954	6,919
Miami	33,992	17,606	24,970	17,770
Putnam	14,370	4,392	9,397	4,846
Shelby	16,204	6,534	10,006	8,043
Van Wert	10,678	4,095	7,670	4,587
Warren	68,037	26,044	44,961	28,470

By far the largest of these counties are Butler, Clermont, and Warren, all in southwestern Ohio. According to the amended election results, these three counties combined gave to George W. Bush a plurality of 132,684 votes, which is 14,085 votes more than his statewide plurality of 118,599 votes. In other words, these three counties provided to Bush his margin of victory in Ohio. I analyzed these counties on a precinct by precinct basis in my previous paper, "One More Look at Southwestern Ohio," submitted to the Ohio Supreme Court.

<http://web.northnet.org/minstrel/connally.htm>

Many of these same counties turn up as anomalies when compared to the 2000 presidential election. In Mercer, Shelby, and Van Wert counties, Al Gore in 2000 drew more votes than John Kerry in 2004, in a race that drew 925,905 fewer votes statewide; in other words, George W. Bush got all the new voters, all the Ralph Nader voters, and some of the Gore voters, or the equivalent. In Auglaize, Darke, and Paulding counties, Bush got more votes than Gore and Nader combined; in other words, one cannot account for Bush's vote totals, even if he got all the new voters, without some defections from Gore and Nader.

COMPARISON OF 2000 AND 2004 PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS

County	Bush	Kerry	Other	Bush	Gore	Nader	Other
Auglaize	17,016	5,903	115	13,770	5,564	372	186
Darke	18,306	7,846	161	14,817	7,741	452	257
Mercer	15,650	5,118	122	12,485	5,212	392	205
Paulding	6,206	3,610	63	5,210	3,384	242	110
Shelby	16,204	6,534	134	12,476	6,593	392	209
Van Wert	10,678	4,095	54	8,679	4,209	216	115

In the other seven counties in which John Kerry drew fewer votes than Ellen Connally, he did draw more votes than Gore and Nader combined. However, if all the Gore and Nader voters are presumed to have voted for Kerry, the lion's share of the new voters in 2004 must have gone to Bush in order for the official results to be true and correct:

COMPARISON OF 2000 AND 2004 PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS

County	Bush	Kerry	Other	Bush	Gore	Nader	Other
Brown	12,647	7,140	105	10,027	5,972	269	161
Butler	109,872	56,243	704	86,587	46,390	2,708	1,052
Clermont	62,949	25,887	243	47,129	20,927	1,303	518
Highland	12,211	6,194	76	9,728	5,328	245	146
Miami	33,992	17,606	162	26,037	15,584	879	341
Putnam	14,370	4,392	87	12,837	4,063	254	190
Warren	68,037	26,044	341	48,318	19,142	1,067	551

Specifically, Bush must have gotten 74.04% (2564 of 3463) of the new voters in Brown County, 76.25% (22,937 of 30,082) in Butler County, 80.96% (15,545 of 19,202) in Clermont County, 79.53% (2413 of 3034) in Highland County, 86.58% (7776 of 8981) in Miami County, 95.02% (1430 of 1505) in Putnam County, and 76.98% in Warren County (19,509 of 25,344).

The counties listed above are quite anomalous. Statewide, Kerry defeated Bush among new voters. Even if all the Gore and Nader voters from 2000 are presumed to have voted for Kerry in 2004, Bush needed fewer than half (459,193 of 925,905, or 49.59%) of the new voters to account for his showing in the 2004 election:

COMPARISON OF 2000 AND 2004 ELECTIONS, STATEWIDE

Bush	2,350,363	Bush	2,859,764	+ 509,401
Gore	2,183,628	Kerry	2,741,165	+ 557,537
Nader	117,799	Nader *	0	- 117,799
Other	50,208	Other	26,974	- 23,234
Total	4,701,998	Total	5,627,903	+ 925,905

* Nader did receive some votes in the 2004 election, as will be shown below. According to the Secretary of State's website, he did not.

The irregularities in the 2004 election reach far beyond the "Connally Anomaly." For example, in Brown County, John Kerry was outpolled not only by Ellen Connally, but by four other Democrats as well:

COMPARISON OF BROWN COUNTY RACES, 2004

Office	Republican	Democrat
President of the United States	12,647	7,140
Ohio State Representative	11,675	7,284
County Commissioner	10,922	8,119
County Commissioner	9,548	7,992
Clerk of Courts of Common Pleas	10,248	8,907

These were not locally popular Democrats who might have been expected to run ahead of the Democratic candidate for president. Some of them were sacrificial lambs. Cy Richardson, the Democratic candidate for Ohio State Representative, District 88, lost to Danny Bulp with 37.61% of the vote. Kathy Cooper Gast and Margery Paeltz lost their races for County Commissioner with 42.64% and 42.19% of the vote, respectively.

In Butler County, Dale Richter received only 39.04% of the vote for County Sheriff, in a race that drew 13,115 fewer votes than the presidential race, and still he managed to outpoll John Kerry:

COMPARISON OF BUTLER COUNTY RESULTS, 2004

Office	Republican	Democrat	Others
President of the United States	109,872	56,243	704
County Sheriff	93,694	60,010	0

In Clermont County, the races for County Commissioner and Judge of Common Pleas drew 5,318 fewer votes and 19,508 fewer votes, respectively, than the presidential race, and still the losing Democrats, Peter Strasser and Ronald Mason, outpolled John Kerry:

COMPARISON OF CLERMONT COUNTY RESULTS, 2004

Office	Republican	Democrat	Others
President of the United States	62,946	25,885	243
County Commissioner	54,972	28,789	0
Judge of Common Pleas, Domestic	40,628	28,943	0

In Darke County, David Niley received only 36.98% of the vote for County Commissioner, and still he managed to outpoll John Kerry:

COMPARISON OF DARKE COUNTY RESULTS, 2004

Office	Republican	Democrat	Others
President of the United States	18,302	7,848	161
County Commissioner	12,615	9,337	3,294

In Auglaize County, John Kerry ran behind Ellen Connally in 34 of 39 precincts. Connally lost the county with 39.01% of the vote. Kerry ran behind Ben Konop, the Democratic candidate for Congress, in all 39 precincts. Konop lost the district with 41.40% of the vote, winning only 38.80% of the vote in Auglaize County. Kerry also ran behind Kenneth Ludwig, the Democratic candidate for Ohio State Representative, in 12 of 14 precincts. Ludwig lost the district with 32.01% of the vote. Kerry ran behind Theodore Voorhees, Democratic candidate for County Commissioner, in 31 of 39 precincts. Voorhees lost the county with 34.90% of the vote.

COMPARISON OF AUGLAIZE COUNTY RESULTS, 2004

Office	Republican	Democrat	Others
President of the United States	17,016	5,903	115
United States Congress	13,850	8,783	0
County Commissioner	14,224	7,624	0

In Auglaize, Putnam, and Van Wert counties, John Kerry was outpolled not only by Ellen Connally, candidate for Chief Justice, but by the losing candidates in two Associate Justice races as well:

COMPARISON OF PRESIDENTIAL AND ASSOCIATE JUSTICE RESULTS, 2004

County	Bush	Kerry	O'Donnell	O'Neill	Lanzinger	Fuerst
Auglaize	17,016	5,903	11,689	6,602	11,952	6,497
Putnam	14,370	4,392	9,592	4,566	9,406	4,854
Van Wert	10,678	4,095	7,026	4,788	6,333	5,854

This did not happen in any other counties in Ohio. Statewide, these races were competitive, but not as close as the presidential election. And they attracted far fewer voters. There is no credible reason for John Kerry to have received fewer votes than these candidates in any county in the State of Ohio.

COMPARISON OF STATEWIDE RESULTS, 2004

Bush	2,859,764	50.81%
Kerry	2,741,165	48.71%
Other	26,974	
Total	5,627,903	
Moyer	2,358,135	53.21%
Connally	2,073,886	46.79%
Total	4,432,021	
O'Donnell	2,560,609	60.50%
O'Neill	1,671,827	39.50%
Total	4,232,436	
Lanzinger	2,500,966	57.01%
Fuerst	1,885,959	42.99%
Total	4,386,925	

The counties listed above are contiguous. Nearly all of them are clustered within two tiers of counties along the Indiana border. I have examined Butler, Clermont, Miami and Warren counties in detail in previous papers submitted to the Ohio Supreme Court. We have precinct canvass records for the 2004 presidential election, and for certain other races as well, in Auglaize, Brown, Darke, Mercer, Shelby, and Van Wert counties. We lack Highland, Putnam, and Paulding counties. The most interesting comparisons available to us are examined here.

SHELBY COUNTY

Shelby County reported the highest percentage voter turnout in Ohio. It was formerly surpassed by Sandusky County, where at least 3,600 votes were rescinded after it was discovered that ballots from nine precincts had been counted twice. According to official results for Shelby County, there were 28,460 registered voters, 23,287 ballots cast, and a turnout of 81.82%. These numbers cannot be verified, because, according to a letter from Shelby County election officials dated December 2, 2004, the county discarded "tabulator test deck reports" from the November 2 vote count "to reduce paperwork and confusion with official results."

<http://www.freepress.org/departments/display/19/2004/975>

Because precinct lines have been redrawn since the 2000 election, no meaningful precinct comparison is possible. Therefore, only the ward or township totals are listed in the table below:

VOTER TURNOUT, SHELBY COUNTY, 2000 AND 2004 ELECTIONS

	- 2004 Election -			- 2000 Election -		
	Registered Voters	Ballots Cast	Percent Turnout	Registered Voters	Ballots Cast	Percent Turnout
Sidney 1	2751	2216	80.55%	2903	1927	66.37%
Sidney 2	3091	2368	76.61%	3253	1999	61.45%
Sidney 3	2461	1701	69.12%	2689	1411	52.47%
Sidney 4	2774	2200	79.31%	2896	1934	66.78%
Clinton Twp	665	544	81.80%	738	516	69.92%
Cynthian Twp	1276	1111	87.07%	1260	949	75.32%
Dinsmore Twp	2470	2047	82.87%	2204	1557	70.64%
Franklin Twp	1027	880	80.77%	1430	1026	71.75%
Green Twp	584	510	87.33%	588	437	74.32%
Jackson Ctr Vil	823	690	83.84%	874	602	68.88%
Jackson Twp	625	538	86.08%	675	501	74.22%
Loramie Twp	1552	1341	86.40%	1483	1126	75.93%
McLean Twp	1950	1673	85.79%	1966	1462	74.36%
Orange Twp	838	706	84.25%	820	616	75.12%
Perry Twp	699	581	83.12%	714	486	68.07%
Salem Twp	1428	1175	82.28%	1439	1028	71.44%
Turtle Twp	971	851	87.64%	945	701	74.18%
Van Buren Twp	1355	1211	89.37%	1592	1146	71.98%
Washington Twp	1120	943	84.20%	1109	707	63.75%
Total	28460	23286	81.82%	29578	20131	68.06%

In Shelby County, in 2000, there were 1,118 more registered voters than in 2004:

<u>SHELBY COUNTY</u>	2000	2004	Difference
Population	47901	48566	+ 1.388%
Registered Voters	29578	28460	- 3.780%
Ballots Cast	20131	23287	+ 15.68%
Percent Turnout	68.06%	81.82%	

As stated above, John Kerry received fewer votes in 2004 than Al Gore in 2000, despite the huge increase in turnout. Bush's share of the vote rose increased from 63.43% in 2000 to 70.85% in 2004. Bush's margin of victory increased from 5883 votes to 9669 votes, and his point spread increased from 29.91% to 42.31%. Bush got all the new voters, all the Nader voters, and some of the Gore voters.

Or did he? Take a look at the precinct canvass results. The entire county is presented below:

COMPARISON OF 2000 AND 2004 PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS, SHELBY COUNTY

Ward or Town	Bush	Kerry	Nader	Other	Bush	Gore	Nader	Other
Sidney Ward 1	1477	673	2	19	1204	624	49	7
Sidney Ward 2	1461	848	7	7	1070	813	40	14
Sidney Ward 3	919	739	2	11	631	688	27	23
Sidney Ward 4	1408	728	0	14	1079	722	52	24
Clinton Twp	361	165	1	2	289	189	16	7
Cynthian Twp	794	280	1	6	631	278	9	11
Dinsmore Twp	1611	396	1	9	1086	384	32	20
Franklin Twp	698	161	0	3	689	288	23	9
Green Twp	369	130	1	4	284	138	4	3
Jackson Ctr Vil	500	164	0	7	373	200	10	4
Jackson Twp	398	127	0	3	353	125	14	3
Loramie Twp	988	324	1	6	756	308	21	14
McLean Twp	1230	408	0	5	926	479	21	12
Orange Twp	488	207	0	3	383	205	11	3
Perry Twp	411	164	0	1	319	145	6	7
Salem Twp	813	347	1	7	621	363	16	13
Turtle Twp	653	179	1	2	464	201	13	11
Van Buren Twp	1007	185	0	6	900	192	20	16
Washington Twp	618	309	0	1	418	251	8	8
Total	16204	6534	18	116	12476	6593	392	209

The official results certified by Secretary of State J. Kenneth Blackwell award 56 votes to Michael Badnarik, 60 votes to Michael Peroutka, and zero to Ralph Nader. The precinct canvass records provided by the Board of Elections list an additional 18 votes for "Candidate not on Official Ballot." That would be Ralph Nader. Most counties identified this column as "Candidate Disqualified," and their tabulators were programmed not to count the votes. 11 of the 18 Nader votes turned up in the City of Sidney where, in the 2000 election, Nader received 168 of his 392 votes. It is fairly obvious that Nader's name was left on the ballot in Shelby County in 2004.

But more importantly, compare the vote totals for the major party candidates. Even with Nader's name on the ballot illegally, one would expect Kerry to receive many more votes than Gore, given the 15.68% increase in ballots cast. This is not what happened in Shelby County.

In Sidney, if one assumes that Nader's net loss of 157 votes went to Kerry, then he got none of the new voters. All 1248 of them voted for Bush. The same thing is true of the new voters in Cynthian, Dinsmore, Jackson, Loramie, and Orange townships. All 996 of them voted for Bush. Only in Perry and Washington townships did Kerry receive more votes than Gore and Nader combined, but he got the votes of no more than 63 of 342 new voters. In Jackson Center Village, and in Clinton, Franklin, Green, McLean, Salem, Turtle, and Van Buren townships, Bush gained 1085 votes, Nader lost 119 votes, and Kerry got 311 fewer votes than Gore. County wide, Bush got 3092 of 3155 new voters.

This huge increase in ballots cast allegedly occurred despite a substantial decrease in the number of registered voters. In 2000, the highest reported turnout was Cynthian Township, with 75.32%. In 2004, only one jurisdiction, Sidney Ward 3, reported a lower turnout than that. The rise in voter turnout was remarkably consistent, ranging from 9.02% in Franklin Township to 20.45% in Washington Township, and clustering between 10.47% and 17.39% in 16 of 19 jurisdictions.

I don't believe it. I challenge the official results. I find it far more likely that Bush got 92 of 155 new voters, and that 3000 votes for Bush were added to the totals, county wide, across the boards, in nearly every precinct. Or, given that Kerry ran 1,509 votes behind Ellen Connally, about 1,500 votes were shifted from Kerry to Bush.

BROWN COUNTY

In Brown County, there was a 20.28% increase in ballots cast compared to the 2000 election. There were 3463 more votes for president. Ralph Nader got 269 votes in 2000, but his name was not on the ballot in 2004. If one assumes that these votes went to Kerry, then he got only 899 (25.96%) of the new voters, compared to 2564 (74.04%) for Bush.

<u>BROWN COUNTY</u>	2000	2004	Difference
Population	42285	43807	+ 3.599%
Registered Voters	26955	28922	+ 7.297%
Ballots Cast	16862	20281	+ 20.28%
Percent Turnout	62.56%	70.12%	
Total Votes	16429	19892	3463
Bush	10027	12647	2620
Gore/Kerry	5972	7140	1168
Nader	269	0	-269
Others	161	105	-56

In Brown County, John Kerry ran 358 votes behind Ellen Connally. But precinct analysis tells a stronger story. Kerry ran behind Connally in 22 of 35 precincts, by 643 votes in the aggregate. In 17 of these 22 precincts, one cannot account for George W. Bush's vote totals even if

one assumes that he got the votes of all those who voted for Thomas J. Moyer for Chief Justice, and of all those who did not vote for Chief Justice. In these 17 precincts, there were 6160 votes for Bush, 3937 votes for Moyer, and 1812 undervotes for Chief Justice. Thus, at least 411 persons must have voted for both Bush and Connally, in order for the official results to be true and correct. The actual number is probably closer to 643, because for every person who did not vote for Chief Justice and voted for Kerry, there would have to be another person who voted for both Bush and Connally. I don't believe it. It seems far more likely that at least 400 votes, and perhaps as many as 650 votes, have been shifted from Kerry to Bush, resulting in a net loss of 800 to 1300 votes for John Kerry.

PRECINCTS WHERE KERRY RAN BEHIND CONNALLY, BROWN COUNTY

Precinct	Ballots					No Vote C.J.	Bush & Connally
	Cast	Bush	Kerry	Connally	Moyer		
Clark Hamersville	682	439	214	227	328	127	
Clark Twp West	649	423	221	242	269	138	16
Eagle Twp	625	419	193	220	277	128	14
Franklin Twp	567	378	179	194	258	115	5
Franklin Waynoka	329	207	120	131	142	56	9
Mt Orab North	717	446	253	302	290	125	31
Green Twp North	359	234	117	142	146	71	17
Green Twp South	503	326	163	187	211	105	10
Aberdeen North	439	260	169	190	256	93	
Huntington Twp	495	305	179	213	180	102	23
Jackson Township	725	462	242	244	121	160	
Perry Twp Village	598	385	199	224	259	115	11
Perry Twp South	542	370	160	191	254	97	19
Perry Twp West	551	379	156	203	233	115	31
Perry Lake Lorelei	607	417	176	233	266	108	43
Pike Twp West	605	391	205	242	230	133	28
Georgetown East	621	371	237	254	241	126	4
Georgetown North	680	417	247	249	273	158	
Sterling NE	503	358	136	197	213	93	52
Sterling Twp West	388	287	92	136	170	82	35
Sterling Twp South	661	464	187	260	298	103	63
Sardinia Village	364	212	137	144	159	61	
Subtotal	12210	7950	3982	4625	5074	2411	411
Remainder	8071	4697	3158	2873	3488	1810	0
County Wide	20281	12647	7140	7498	8562	4221	411

AUGLAIZE COUNTY

In Auglaize County, there was little change in population between 2000 and 2004, and turnout was about the same in both elections. The increase in ballots cast was due to an increase in voter registration. There were 3142 more votes for president. Ralph Nader, whose name was on the ballot illegally in Auglaize County, and whose name is flagrantly listed in the precinct canvass records, got 92 votes in 2004, compared to 372 votes in the 200 election, for a net loss of 280 votes. If one assumes that these 280 votes went to Kerry, then he got only 59 (1.88%) of the new voters, compared to 3083 (98.12%) for Bush.

<u>AUGLAIZE COUNTY</u>	2000	2004	Difference
Population	46611	46740	+ 0.277%
Registered Voters	28693	33094	+ 15.34%
Ballots Cast	20212	23297	+ 15.26%
Percent Turnout	70.44%	70.40%	- 0.04%
Total Votes	19892	23034	3142
Bush	13770	17016	3246
Gore/Kerry	5564	5903	339
Nader	372	92	-280
Others	186	115	-71

In Auglaize County, John Kerry ran 1642 votes behind Ellen Connally. Kerry ran behind Connally in 34 of 39 precincts, by 1738 votes in the aggregate. In 29 of these 34 precincts, one cannot account for George W. Bush's vote totals even if one assumes that he got the votes of all those who voted for Thomas J. Moyer for Chief Justice, and of all those who did not vote for Chief Justice. In these 29 precincts, there were 13,296 votes for Bush, 8924 votes for Moyer, and 2960 undervotes for Chief Justice. Thus, at least 1412 persons must have voted for both Bush and Connally, in order for the official results to be true and correct. The actual number is probably closer to 1738, because for every person who did not vote for Chief Justice and voted for Kerry, there would have to be another person who voted for both Bush and Connally. I don't believe it. It seems far more likely that at least 1400 votes, and perhaps as many as 1750 votes, have been shifted from Kerry to Bush, resulting in a net loss of 2800 to 3500 votes for John Kerry.

AUGLAIZE COUNTY PRECINCT CANVASS, 2004

Precinct	Ballots				No Vote C.J.	Bush & Connally	
	Cast	Bush	Kerry	Connally			
St Marys City 1-A	587	403	171	225	257	105	41
St Marys City 1-B	394	274	113	118	193	83	
St Marys City 2-A	523	349	166	207	221	95	33
St Marys City 2-B	767	494	264	218	387	162	
St Marys City 3-A	749	493	244	261	347	141	5
St Marys City 4-A	566	311	238	207	259	100	
Wapakoneta City 1-A	821	632	183	262	424	135	73
Wapakoneta City 1-B	653	450	199	188	350	115	
Wapakoneta City 2-A	452	313	136	159	214	79	20
Wapakoneta City 2-B	585	421	156	175	312	98	11
Wapakoneta City 3-A	394	249	133	170	167	57	25
Wapakoneta City 3-B	381	246	124	130	185	66	
Wapakoneta City 4-A	376	250	123	134	180	62	8
Wapakoneta City 4-B	654	428	209	208	325	121	
Clay Township	436	329	102	137	240	59	30
Cridersville Vill	892	623	254	258	500	134	
Duchoquet Twp W	759	545	201	225	406	128	11
Duchoquet Twp E	848	661	178	240	515	93	53
New Bremen Village E	878	679	189	316	392	170	117
New Bremen Village W	730	555	163	225	374	131	50

AUGLAIZE COUNTY PRECINCT CANVASS, 2004 (CONTINUED)

Precinct	Ballots				No Vote		Bush &
	Cast	Bush	Kerry	Connally	Moyer	C.J.	Connally
German Township	497	394	93	165	255	77	62
Goshen Township	274	206	63	84	151	39	16
Minster Village N	828	642	171	298	374	156	112
Minster Village S	764	607	148	222	410	132	65
Jackson Township	512	432	74	145	285	82	65
Buckland Village	123	73	47	41	59	23	
Logan Township	540	438	95	174	279	87	72
Moulton Township	991	756	216	258	548	185	23
Noble Township	692	513	174	258	321	113	79
Pusheta Township	702	520	162	215	370	117	33
St Marys Township E	896	677	203	301	412	183	82
St Marys Township W	844	573	254	259	448	137	
Salem Township	281	215	59	91	133	57	25
Uniopolis Village	132	95	37	45	67	20	8
Union Township	883	685	188	290	450	143	92
New Knoxville Vill	511	429	73	148	281	82	66
Washington Township	577	472	91	188	308	81	83
Waynesfield Village	368	240	119	123	197	48	
Wayne Township	428	336	90	144	231	53	52
Federal	5	4	1	0	1	4	
Total	23297	17016	5903	7545	11795	3957	1412

How the vote totals could have been altered is easily explained. A letter dated October 21 under the signature of Ken Nuss, former deputy director of the Auglaize County Board of Elections alleges that Joe McGinnis, a former employee of Election Systems & Software (ES&S), violated election protocol with his unauthorized use of the county's central tabulating computer that creates ballots and compiles election results. Nuss, who resigned on October 21, alleges that McGinnis was improperly granted access to the computer the weekend of October 16.

<http://www.freepress.org/columns/display/3/2004/983>

County wide in Auglaize County, as stated above, John Kerry ran behind not only Ellen Connally, the losing candidate for Chief Justice. He ran behind Nancy Fuerst and William O'Neill, the losing candidates for two Associate Justice positions. And he ran behind Ben Konop, Kenneth Ludwig, and Theodore Voorhees, the losing Democratic candidates for United States Congress, Ohio State Representative, and Auglaize County Commissioner. In 15 of 39 precincts he ran behind all of them at once:

PRECINCTS WHERE KERRY RAN BEHIND EVERYBODY, AUGLAIZE COUNTY

Precinct	Kerry	Connally	Fuerst	O'Neill	Konop	Ludwig	Voorhees
Wapakoneta 2-B	156	175	175	187	237	...	264
Clay Township	102	170	137	115	180	108	142
Duchouquet Twp	178	240	219	292	371	224	321
New Bremen Vil W	163	225	190	222	180	...	173

PRECINCTS WHERE KERRY RAN BEHIND EVERYBODY, AUGLAIZE COUNTY (CONTINUED)

Precinct	Kerry	Connally	Fuerst	O'Neill	Konop	Ludwig	Voorhees
German Township	93	165	110	122	132	...	104
Goshen Township	63	84	95	85	123	70	81
Minster Vil S	148	222	202	227	162	...	149
Logan Township	95	174	167	131	228	118	213
Pusheta Township	162	215	174	198	281	179	271
St Marys Twp E	203	301	211	215	281	...	207
Salem Township	59	91	70	71	119	...	70
Uniopolis Vil	37	45	39	44	71	43	72
Union Township	188	290	254	225	399	229	269
Washington Twp	91	188	159	124	193	111	146
Wayne Township	90	144	135	110	187	107	119

These figures cannot be right. There is no way that all six of these candidates received more votes than John Kerry in any one precinct.

Well, John Kerry didn't actually run behind everybody. He did manage to outpoll Eric Fingerhut, the Democratic candidate for United States Senate, who received only 21.21% of the vote county wide, and 36.14% state wide, against George Voinovich, the biggest votegetter in the State of Ohio. Voinovich outpolled George W. Bush by 604,883 votes, running ahead of Bush in all 88 counties. Voinovich even drew 135,316 more votes than Issue One, the constitutional amendment banning gay marriage. Even so, Kerry managed to run behind Fingerhut in Logan Township, where Kerry received 95 votes, and Fingerhut got 99 votes.

COMPARISON OF PRESIDENTIAL AND SENATE RACES, STATEWIDE

Bush	2,859,764	50.81%	Voinovich	3,464,651	63.85%
Kerry	2,741,165	48.71%	Fingerhut	1,961,249	36.15%
Other	26,974	0.48%	Total	5,425,900	
Total	5,627,903				

Statewide, Bush received 82.54% of the total votes cast for Voinovich. But there were seven counties where Bush ran within 5% of Voinovich:

COUNTIES WHERE BUSH RAN WITHIN 5% OF VOINOVICH

County	Bush	Kerry	Voinovich	Fingerhut	B:V
Van Wert	10678	4095	10697	3721	99.82%
Putnam	14370	4392	14671	3794	97.95%
Allen	32580	16470	33463	13106	97.36%
Paulding	6206	3610	6385	3134	97.20%
Mercer	15650	5118	16334	4379	95.81%
Auglaize	17016	5903	17771	4785	95.75%
Shelby	16204	6535	17060	5111	94.98%

Van Wert County is the most interesting. It looks as if the tabulators were set with an upper limit, not to allow the county wide totals for Bush to exceed those for Voinovich, lest anyone become suspicious.

VAN WERT COUNTY

In Van Wert County, there was a decrease in population and in voter registration between 2000 and 2004. And yet, the number of ballots cast in 2004 was 15.25% higher than in 2000.

<u>VAN WERT COUNTY</u>	2000	2004	Difference
Population	29659	29277	- 1.288
Registered Voters	21841	21100	- 3.393
Ballots Cast	13471	15525	+ 15.25
Percent Turnout	61.68%	73.58%	
Total Votes	13219	14827	1608
Bush	8679	10678	1999
Gore/Kerry	4209	4095	-114
Nader	216	0	-216
Others	115	54	-61

In Van Wert County, there were 1,608 more votes for president in 2004 than in 2000. According to Green Party observers of the partial "recount," the name of Ralph Nader was still on the ballot illegally. In fact, he received one vote in one of the two precincts recounted, although votes for Nader are not reported in the precinct canvass records or on the website of Ohio Secretary of State J. Kenneth Blackwell. Officially, Nader received zero votes in 2004, having received 216 votes in 2000. John Kerry received 114 fewer votes than Al Gore. Bush had a net gain of 1999 votes. Bush got all the new voters, and at least 330, or 7.46%, of the Gore and Nader voters.

Kerry ran ahead of Gore in 14 of 39 precincts in Van Wert County. In 11 of these 14 precincts, Kerry ran ahead of Gore and Nader combined. Still, Bush got the lion's share of the new voters. In these 14 precincts, there were 906 more votes for president in 2004 than in the 2000 election. Nader got zero votes in 2004, having received 80 votes in 2000. Kerry received 206 more votes than Gore. If one assumes that the 80 Nader voters went to Kerry, then he got only 126 (13.9%) of the new voters, compared to 780 (86.1%) for Bush.

PRECINCTS WHERE KERRY GOT MORE VOTES THAN GORE, VAN WERT COUNTY

Precinct	Bush	Kerry	Other	Bush	Gore	Nader	Other
Delphos 3 A	168	65	0	128	60	2	0
Delphos 3 B	229	129	0	194	115	1	1
Delphos 3 C	173	95	2	127	75	0	1
Delphos 4 B	257	79	1	183	70	5	2
Van Wert 1 A	194	139	2	139	100	7	2
Van Wert 3 C	345	154	3	223	150	10	6
Van Wert 3 D	275	140	4	229	136	9	2
Van Wert 4 A	178	80	1	138	70	7	1
Hoaglin	254	92	1	222	71	8	3
Jennings	296	63	1	221	53	8	3
Pleasant West	283	120	0	236	101	9	0
Tully	391	154	2	348	137	5	4
Washington East	393	119	2	357	88	5	3
Willshire	362	167	1	259	164	4	6
Subtotal	3798	1596	20	3004	1390	80	34
Total	10678	4094	54	8679	4209	216	115

Kerry ran behind Gore in 25 of 39 precincts in Van Wert County. In these 25 precincts, there were 702 more votes for president in 2004 than in the 2000 election. Kerry received 321 fewer votes than Gore. Nader got zero votes in 2004, having gotten 136 votes in 2000. Bush had a net gain of 1205 votes. Bush got all the new voters, and at least 457, or 15.47%, of the Gore and Nader voters.

PRECINCTS WHERE KERRY GOT FEWER VOTES THAN GORE, VAN WERT COUNTY

Precinct	Bush	Kerry	Other	Bush	Gore	Nader	Other
Delphos 4 A	207	82	1	162	95	4	2
Van Wert 1 B	201	101	2	151	102	6	7
Van Wert 1 D	188	89	0	140	102	3	2
Van Wert 2 A	183	75	3	161	86	3	2
Van Wert 2 B	248	111	3	183	116	8	6
Van Wert 2 C	254	119	2	161	124	11	6
Van Wert 2 D	215	115	5	181	119	3	4
Van Wert 3 A	183	66	1	141	77	1	2
Van Wert 3 B	197	84	2	157	93	7	5
Van Wert 4 B	284	130	1	192	151	3	2
Van Wert 4 C	0	0	0	253	139	3	0
Van Wert 4 D	405	118	4	344	120	4	1
Harrison	454	154	0	365	161	5	8
Jackson	188	54	1	152	58	4	3
Ohio City	229	98	0	189	101	8	2
Liberty	397	111	2	314	114	8	4
Pleasant East	308	103	1	266	108	6	4
Ridge	576	159	1	451	161	6	2
Convoy	324	180	1	256	183	7	4
Union	379	127	1	318	149	6	3
Middle Point	210	92	0	146	110	5	1
Washington West	289	44	1	232	54	1	1
Wren	236	78	0	192	81	7	5
York	384	77	1	298	82	10	3
Pleasant North	341	131	1	270	133	7	2
Subtotal	6880	2498	34	5675	2819	136	81
Total	10678	4094	54	8679	4209	216	115

I don't believe the precinct canvass records. I don't believe that, county wide, Bush got 1482 (92.16%) of 1608 new voters, and 457 (10.33%) of the Gore and Nader voters. Nor do I accept that voter turnout increased from 61.68% in 2000 to 73.54% in 2004. There is little evidence of increased interest in politics in Van Wert County. The number of registered voters actually decreased by 741 (3.39%) between 2000 and 2004. Bush won Van Wert County by 4470 votes in 2000. Even with a 15.25% increase in ballots cast, one would not have expected Bush's margin of victory to exceed about 5150 votes in 2004. It seems far more likely that 1400 votes have been added to Bush's total, or that 700 votes have been shifted from Kerry to Bush.

Van Wert County utilized punch cards, which were counted by a tabulator manufactured and serviced by Triad Governmental Systems, Inc. During the partial "recount" staged in mid-December 2004, Board of Elections officials were asked by Green Party observers if Triad had serviced the machine. The deputy director and a board member stated that Triad had serviced the machine over the phone via modem on December 9th.

http://www.iwantmyvote.org/recount/ohio_reports/counties/vanwert.php

As stated above, Bush very nearly outpolled Voinovich in Van Wert County, coming within 19 votes. Bush actually did run ahead of Voinovich in 17 of 39 precincts, a pattern unmatched elsewhere in Ohio:

PRECINCTS WHERE BUSH OUTPOLLED VOINOVICH, VAN WERT COUNTY

Precinct	Bush	Kerry	Other	Voinovich	Fingerhut
Delphos 3 C	173	95	2	171	84
Van Wert 1 D	188	89	0	185	77
Van Wert 2 C	254	119	2	239	127
Van Wert 3 C	345	154	3	330	151
Van Wert 4 B	284	130	1	277	128
Harrison	454	154	0	446	149
Hoaglin	254	92	1	241	94
Jackson	188	54	1	186	44
Jennings	296	63	1	291	59
Liberty	397	111	2	375	117
Ridge	576	159	1	565	151
Union	379	127	1	374	121
Middle Point	210	92	0	209	83
Washington West	289	44	1	278	53
Willshire	362	167	1	352	170
Wren	236	78	0	228	71
York	384	77	1	379	73

DARKE COUNTY

In Darke County, compared to 2000, there was a slight decrease in population, a substantial increase in voter registration, and a much greater increase in ballots cast. Voter turnout increased from 65.91% in 2000 to 70.57% in 2004.

<u>DARKE COUNTY</u>	2000	2004	Difference
Population	53309	52960	- 0.655
Registered Voters	36088	38290	+ 6.102
Ballots Cast	23784	27022	+ 13.61
Percent Turnout	65.91%	70.57%	
Total Votes	23267	26313	3046
Bush	14817	18306	3489
Gore/Kerry	7741	7846	105
Nader	452	0	-452
Others	257	161	-96

In Darke County, there were 3,046 more votes for president in 2004 than in 2000. Ralph Nader got zero votes, compared to 452 in the 2000 election. His line is properly listed in the precinct canvass records as "Candidate Withdrawn." Kerry received only 105 more votes than Gore, all of which could have come from former supporters of Nader. Bush had a net gain of 3,489 votes. Bush got all the new voters and at least 347 (4.24%) of the Gore and Nader voters.

John Kerry ran behind Ellen Connally by 1175 votes county wide, including 34 of 43 precincts. In 29 of these precincts, one cannot account for George W. Bush's vote totals even if one assumes that he got the votes of all those who voted for Thomas J. Moyer for Chief Justice, and of all those who did not vote for Chief Justice. In these 29 precincts, there were 13,614 votes for Bush, 9144 votes for Moyer, and 3614 undervotes for Chief Justice. Thus, at least 856 persons must have voted for both Bush and Connally, in order for the official results to be true and correct. The actual number is probably closer to 1175, because for every person who did not vote for Chief Justice and voted for Kerry, there would have to be another person who voted for both Bush and Connally. It seems far more likely that at least 850 votes, and perhaps as many as 1200 votes, have been shifted from Kerry to Bush, resulting in a net loss of 1700 to 2400 votes for John Kerry.

PRECINCTS WHERE KERRY RAN BEHIND CONNALLY, DARKE COUNTY

Precinct	Ballots				Moyer	No Vote C.J.	Bush & Connally
	Cast	Bush	Kerry	Connally			
Greenville 1-A	530	330	185	211	234	85	11
Greenville 1-C	520	349	158	174	232	114	3
Greenville 2-B	506	286	207	210	192	104	
Greenville 3-A	472	144	97	99	99	274	
Greenville 3-C	755	492	245	274	326	155	11
Greenville 4-A	415	260	141	163	185	67	8
Greenville 4-B	790	505	267	303	329	158	18
Adams East	746	489	249	259	370	117	2
Adams West	864	586	261	273	429	162	
Allen Township	556	405	138	212	239	105	61
Butler & Castine	711	521	172	255	333	123	65
Franklin Township	551	433	106	132	301	118	14
Greenville E-A	568	381	184	215	259	94	28
Greenville E-B	702	475	214	223	350	129	
Greenville W-A	801	584	200	310	346	145	93
Greenville W-B	522	379	134	160	269	93	17
Harrison West	494	362	122	172	228	94	40
Harrison East	801	561	228	260	401	140	20
Liberty Twp	527	357	150	203	204	120	33
Monroe Twp	938	708	215	320	474	144	90
Wayne Lakes Village	406	263	135	141	200	65	
Neave Twp	719	475	229	283	319	117	39
Patterson Township	734	580	117	180	423	131	26
Richland Township	459	322	130	164	204	91	27
Arcanum A	618	453	150	173	326	119	8
Arcanum B	507	373	124	184	234	89	50
Twin Township	1099	831	234	297	617	185	29
Van Buren Township	867	634	210	309	404	154	76
Wabash & North Star	550	446	92	117	309	124	13
Washington Township	637	421	201	228	293	116	12
Versailles A	697	467	209	231	328	138	1
Versailles B	718	513	191	215	316	187	10
Wayne Township	1049	790	224	307	531	211	48
York Township	291	193	91	101	110	80	3

Bush won Darke County by 7076 votes in the 2000 election, and by 10,460 votes in the 2004 election. Even with a 13.61% increase in ballots cast, one would not have expected Bush's margin of victory to exceed about 8040 votes in 2004. This is consistent with the interpretation that as many as 1200 votes were shifted from Kerry to Bush.

By far the most interesting precinct in Darke County is Greenville 3-A. There were 710 uncounted ballots for president in all of Darke County, and 228 of them were in this precinct, Greenville 3-A. There were 681 registered voters, 472 ballots cast, 244 votes counted for president, and 228 uncounted ballots, or 48.3% of the total. There were even fewer votes counted for the other contested offices. In a three-way contest for State Board of Education there were 165 votes counted, and 307 overvotes/undervotes. It was the uncontested races and the ballot propositions that seemed to draw the most interest in this precinct:

VOTES COUNTED, DARKE COUNTY, GREENVILLE, PRECINCT 3-A

Contested Offices:

President of the United States	244
Unites States Senator	237
Representative to Congress	237
Member, State Board of Education	165
Chief Justice of Supreme Court	198
Associate Justice of Supreme Court	194
Court of Appeals	180
Court of Appeals	183
State Senator	218
State Representative	239
County Commissioner	236
County Commissioner	229

Uncontested Offices:

Associate Justice of Supreme Court	290
Court of Appeals	290
Court of Appeals	291
County Sheriff	383
County Prosecutor	357
County Clerk of Courts	366
County Recorder	363
County Treasurer	366
County Engineer	343
County Coroner	355
County Common Pleas Judge	344

Ballot Propositions:

Constitutional Amendment, Marriage Protection	449
Income Tax, General Operating Expenses	451
Income Tax, Capital Improvements	448

Imagine that. Toby Spencer, running unopposed for Darke County Sheriff, drew 383 votes in Precinct Greenville 3-A, while only 244 people voted in a hotly contested presidential election. Huey Long must have known what he was talking about when he advised an aspiring young politician of the best way to run for office: "Unopposed, son, unopposed." Almost as many voters, 224 in all, voted to tax themselves as voted for George W. Bush and John F. Kerry combined.

The reason for all of this is revealed by the Van Wert County Board of Elections. There were 699 uncounted ballots for president in all of Van Wert County, and 442 of them were in Precinct Van Wert 4-C. There were 531 registered voters and 442 ballots cast, an impressive turnout of 83.24%, the second highest of 39 precincts in the county. But nobody voted for president. Or no votes were counted for president.

The Van Wert County Board of Elections faxed to me, unsolicited, not once, but twice, the following protestation of innocence, on official Board of Elections stationery. Here is the text, in its entirety:

"The Van Wert County Board of Elections met in special session on Friday, November 19, 2004 for the purpose of certifying the results of the November 2, 2004 General Election.

"Under direction of Ohio Secretary of State, J. Kenneth Blackwell's office, the Official Certified results of the November 2, 2004 General Election for precinct Van Wert 4C reflect "0" results for all opposed candidates. The reason for these "0" results is due to the fact that precinct officials borrowed a voting booth from precinct Van Wert 4D and the rotations, as required by law, for these opposed candidates in the two precincts are not the same.

"All issues and unopposed candidates in precinct Van Wert 4C were counted and the results are reflected in the official certification figures on file in the office of the Van Wert County Board of Elections, 120 E. Main St., Van Wert, Ohio."

Excuse me. In Cleveland, where hundreds of votes were shifted from John Kerry to other candidates, or to "Candidate Disqualified," Blackwell had no compunction about certifying the fraudulent results.

<http://web.northnet.org/minstrel/caterpillar.htm>

But in Precinct Van Wert 4-C, where votes for George W. Bush were shifted to Michael Badnarik, Blackwell ordered the Board of Elections to report an official vote count of zero for the entire precinct.

In Darke County, Precinct Greenville 3-A, obviously, the names of the candidates appeared in the correct order on one of two voting machines.

MERCER COUNTY

In Mercer County, compared to 2000, there was almost no change in population, an unexplained 24.83% increase in voter registration, and a much smaller increase of 13.18% in ballots cast. Voter turnout declined from 75.15% in 2000 to 68.14% in 2004. Only two other counties in Ohio reported a decrease in percentage turnout. One was Auglaize County, where the decline was from 70.44% to 70.40%. The other was Perry County, where voter turnout declined from 72.63% in 2000 to 65.89% in 2004. This was due to voter registration having increased more sharply, from 18,102 to 23,480, than the increase in ballots cast, from 13,147 to 15,472. These increases amount to 5,378 registered voters, and 2,325 ballots cast, a discrepancy of 3,053.

The reason for the discrepancy in Perry County is entirely fraudulent, as documented by members of the House Judiciary Committee in a letter to J. Kenneth Blackwell, dated December 2, 2004:

"In Perry County, there appears to be an extraordinarily high level voter registration, 91%; yet a substantial number of these voters have never voted and have no signature on file. Of the voters that are registered in Perry County an extraordinarily large number of voters are listed as having registered in 1977, a year in which there were no federal elections. Of these an exceptional number are listed as having registered on the exact same day: in total, 3,100 voters apparently registered in Perry County on November 8, 1977."

http://www.truthout.org/mm_01/5.120404W.pdf

The same pattern appears in Mercer County, which reports an increase of 6,227 registered voters, and 2,485 ballots cast. The discrepancy of 3,742 is even greater than the discrepancy in Perry County:

<u>MERCER COUNTY</u>	2000	2004	Difference
Population	40924	40933	+ 0.022%
Registered Voters	25079	31306	+ 24.83%
Ballots Cast	18848	21333	+ 13.18%
Percent Turnout	75.15%	68.14%	
Total Votes	18294	20890	2596
Bush	12485	15650	3165
Gore/Kerry	5212	5118	-94
Nader	392	0	-392
Others	205	122	-83

In Mercer County, there were 2,596 more votes for president in 2004 than in 2000. Officially, Nader received zero votes in 2004, having received 392 votes in 2000. John Kerry received 94 fewer votes than Al Gore. Bush had a net gain of 3,165 votes. Bush got all the new voters, and at least 486, or 8.67%, of the Gore and Nader voters.

During the partial "recount" staged in December 2004, the Deputy Director of the Mercer County Board of Elections mentioned to Green Party observers that because Nader had been disqualified, any votes for him were not counted. She acknowledged that Nader's name had not been covered on the actual punch card units at the polls, and that this had been controversial. The County Attorney explained that the number of votes cast for Nader could not be determined without a complete hand count of the ballots, because technicians from Triad Governmental Systems, Inc., the company that provides the tabulating equipment and the computer software, had come in before the election and reprogrammed everything to simply ignore the Nader votes. He further acknowledged that Triad technicians had been at the Mercer County Board of Elections the day prior to the "recount," that there had been "some problem" with the tabulator, that it had been disassembled, and that the technician had replaced a switch. Green Party witnesses further stated that they were denied access to the poll registry, which might have a similar appearance to the one in Perry County.

http://www.iwantmyvote.org/recount/ohio_reports/counties/mercer.php

In Mercer County, John Kerry received 1,801 fewer votes than Ellen Connally. Officially, Kerry got 5,118 votes, and Connally got 6,919 votes. The ratio of Kerry votes to Connally votes, 0.740, is the lowest of any county in the State of Ohio. County wide, one cannot account for George W. Bush's vote totals even if one assumes that he got the votes of all those who voted for Thomas J. Moyer for Chief Justice, and of all those who did not vote for Chief Justice. There were 15,650 votes for Bush, 9954 for Moyer, and 4460 undervotes for Chief Justice. Thus, at least 1236 persons must have voted for both Bush and Connally, in order for the official results to be true and correct. The actual number is probably closer to 1801, because for every person who did not vote for Chief Justice and voted for Kerry, there would have to be another person who voted for both Bush and Connally. It seems far more likely that at least 1200 votes, and perhaps as many as 1800 votes, have been shifted from Kerry to Bush, resulting in a net loss of 2400 to 3600 votes for John Kerry.

Bush won Mercer County by 7273 votes in the 2000 election, and by 10,532 votes in the 2004 election. Even with a 13.18% increase in ballots cast, one would not have expected Bush's margin of victory to exceed about 8230 votes in 2004. This is consistent with the interpretation that 1200 votes were shifted from Kerry to Bush.

The unreliability of Mercer County election results is explicitly stated in the transcript of a joint Congressional session on the 2004 election, as reported by Earth Angels Network:

In Mercer County, one voting machine showed that 289 people cast punch card ballots, but only 51 votes were recorded for president. The county's website appeared to show a similar anomaly, reporting that 51,818 people cast ballots but only 47,768 ballots were recorded in the presidential race, including 61 write-ins, meaning that approximately 4,000 votes, or nearly 7%, were not counted for a presidential candidate.

http://www.ballotintegrity.org/cgi-bin/dcf/forum/dcbboard.cgi?az=printer_format&forum=DCForumID1&om=272&omm=0

It is no wonder that these numbers were withdrawn. There were only 31,306 registered voters, and only 40,933 people living in the county.

It is interesting to note that, on the Mercer County Board of Elections web page, when one clicks on "Historical Election Data," one is transferred to the website of Ohio Secretary of State J. Kenneth Blackwell, at whose pleasure the Board of Elections members serve.

I had hoped to have conducted a precinct analysis for Mercer County. At present I possess only the presidential results and voter turnout data for the 2004 election. Board of Elections personnel have advised me that they are "not authorized" to release any records without advance payment of 10 cents per page. I sent them \$2.00, with a written request for as many of the following records as they can find:

1. Countywide results for all elective offices, 2004.
2. Precinct results for Chief Justice (Moyer vs. Connally), 2004.
3. Precinct results for presidential election, 2000.
4. Precinct data for voter turnout (registered voters, ballots cast), 2000.

Instead, they faxed me 38 pages of records I had not requested, to wit, the results of the primary election of March 26, 2004. Apparently a personal visit to the Board of Elections will be necessary to pry loose the public records. And yet, these unsolicited results are revealing:

(1) C. Ellen Connally, Nancy A. Fuerst, and William O'Neill, the losing candidates for the Ohio Supreme Court in the general election, all ran as Democrats in the primary election. This puts to rest the notion that these races were non-partisan, and therefore not comparable to the presidential election.

(2) In four precincts, Kerry and Edwards got more votes in the primary election, in which voter turnout in Mercer County was 40.90% (12,498 of 30,557 registered voters), than in the general election, in which voter turnout in Mercer County was 68.14% (21,333 of 31,306 registered voters). And one precinct, Chickasaw, in which 154 ballots were cast in the primary election, is unreported in the general election.

COMPARISON OF PRIMARY AND GENERAL ELECTION RESULTS, MERCER COUNTY

	Primary Election				General Election		
	Ballots	Bush	Kerry	Edwards	Ballots	Bush	Kerry
Henry North	580	198	102	72	723	552	148
Henry South	419	144	57	50	464	359	97
Granville Twp	690	252	75	52	884	750	118
Marion West	339	115	75	65	863	735	104

PUTNAM COUNTY

In Putnam County, compared to 2000, there was almost no change in population, a slight 1.966% increase in voter registration, and a substantial increase of 8.037% in ballots cast.

PUTNAM COUNTY	2000	2004	Difference
Population	34726	34754	+ 0.081%
Registered Voters	24105	24579	+ 1.966%
Ballots Cast	17743	19169	+ 8.037%
Percent Turnout	73.61%	77.99%	
Total Votes	17344	18849	1505
Bush	12837	14370	1533
Gore/Kerry	4063	4392	329
Nader	254	0	-254
Others	190	87	-103

In Putnam County, there were 1,505 more votes for president in 2004 than in 2000. Ralph Nader received zero votes in 2004, having received 254 votes in 2000. John Kerry received 329 more votes than Al Gore, most of which could have come from Nader. George W. Bush had a net gain of 1,533 votes. Bush got 1,430 (95.02%) of the new voters, compared to 75 (4.98%) for Kerry. Bush got 74.01% of the vote in Putnam County in the 2000 election. One would not have expected Bush to receive more than 1,115 of the new voters.

Bush carried Putnam County by 8,774 votes in 2000, and by 9,978 votes in 2004. One would expect, with an 8.037% increase in ballots cast, that Bush would have carried Putnam County by 9,480 votes in 2004.

Since 2000, some precincts have been consolidated, and in Ottawa Corp, Columbus Grove Corp, and Leipsic Corp, precinct boundaries have been redrawn, making comparisons possible only for the entire villages. There are now 35 precincts, and 29 comparable jurisdictions.

In 6 jurisdictions, Kerry got fewer votes than Gore. In 5 others, Kerry got fewer votes than Gore and Nader combined. And in 3 others, Kerry got only 1 or 2 votes more than Gore and Nader combined:

COMPARISON OF 2004 AND 2000 ELECTIONS, PUTNAM COUNTY

	Bush	Kerry	Bush	Gore	Nader	Rep	Dem	D+N
Blanchard Twp	528	132	456	124	7	72	8	1
Jennings Twp West	504	135	462	139	13	42	-4	-17
Liberty Twp East	317	93	290	108	7	27	-15	-22
Monroe Twp	420	149	325	163	10	95	-14	-24
Ottoville Corp	402	138	342	150	8	60	-12	-20
Monterey Twp	467	195	415	180	13	52	15	2
Ottawa Corp	1743	669	1529	640	30	214	29	-1
Ottawa Twp West	431	82	380	77	8	51	5	-3
Palmer Twp	497	149	436	144	13	61	5	-8
Perry Twp	407	150	337	145	9	70	5	-4
Columbus Grove	819	240	705	252	18	114	-12	-30
Pleasant Twp North	335	45	298	37	9	37	8	-1
Riley Twp	541	95	512	89	5	29	6	1
Leipsic Corp	599	252	572	260	8	27	-8	-16
Subtotal	8010	2524	7059	2508	158	951	16	-142

In these 14 jurisdictions, Bush enjoyed a net gain of 951 votes, while Kerry got only 16 more votes than Gore, and 142 fewer votes than Gore and Nader combined. In 2000, Bush got 71.78% of the vote, Gore got 25.50%, and Nader got 1.61%. In 2004, Bush got 75.70% of the vote, and Kerry got 23.85%. Bush's share of the vote increased by 3.92%, and his point spread increased by 5.57%. In the other jurisdictions, these are the results:

COMPARISON OF 2004 AND 2000 ELECTIONS, PUTNAM COUNTY

	Bush	Kerry	Bush	Gore	Nader	Rep	Dem	D+N
Greensburg Twp	652	156	582	128	5	70	28	23
Jackson Twp	387	144	345	115	12	42	29	17
Jennings Twp East	372	84	344	72	2	28	12	10
Liberty Twp West	307	81	281	62	6	26	19	13
Continental Corp	361	214	282	182	9	79	32	23
Glandorf Corp	416	138	373	108	7	43	30	23
Ottawa Twp East 1	358	109	335	88	5	23	21	16
Ottawa Twp East 2	380	104	352	88	9	28	16	7
Pleasant Twp South	503	114	455	98	6	48	16	10
Pandora Corp	507	170	472	135	7	35	35	28
Sugar Creek Twp	548	113	512	97	12	36	16	4
Kalida Corp.	555	140	505	117	3	50	23	20
Union Twp East	367	91	347	77	5	20	14	9
Union Twp West	362	88	315	79	2	47	9	7
Van Buren Twp	285	122	278	109	6	7	13	7
Subtotal	6360	1868	5778	1555	96	582	313	217

In these 15 jurisdictions, Bush had a net gain of 582 votes, Kerry got 313 more votes than Gore, and 217 more votes than Gore and Nader combined. In 2000, Bush got 76.94% of the vote, Gore got 20.71%, and Nader got 1.28%. In 2004, Bush got 76.91% of the vote, and Kerry got 22.59%. Bush's share of the vote was almost unchanged. The results in these 15 jurisdictions make the results look quite irregular in the first 14 jurisdictions where, if Bush's share of the vote had likewise remained the same, he would have received 7595 votes, rather than 8010 votes. This implies a shift of 400 votes from Kerry to Bush, resulting in a net loss of 800 votes for John Kerry.

In Putnam County, John Kerry received 454 fewer votes than Ellen Connally. Officially, Kerry got 4392 votes, and Connally got 4846 votes. County wide, there were 14,370 votes for Bush, 9397 for Moyer, and 4926 undervotes for Chief Justice. Thus, some persons must have voted for both Bush and Connally, in order for the official results to be true and correct. How many cannot be precisely determined by precinct analysis, because the number of ballots cast is not reported. However, the precinct results are directly comparable.

Kerry got fewer votes than Connally in 25 of 35 precincts in Putnam County, by 543 votes in the aggregate. Most of the disparity (285 votes, or 52.5%) was in 6 precincts, and nearly all (433 votes, or 79.7%) was in 12 precincts:

COMPARISON OF PRESIDENTIAL AND CHIEF JUSTICE RACES, PUTNAM COUNTY

	Bush	Kerry	Connally	Moyer	K-C
Blanchard Twp	528	132	156	343	-24
Greensburg Twp	652	156	184	446	-28
Jennings Twp West	504	135	187	309	-52
Liberty Twp West	307	81	103	197	-22
Ottawa Twp East 1	358	109	149	219	-40
Ottawa Twp East 2	380	104	141	243	-37
Ottawa Twp West	431	82	109	280	-27
Palmer Twp	497	149	200	305	-51
Pleasant Twp North	335	45	94	215	-49
Sugar Creek Twp	548	113	169	369	-56
Union Twp East	367	91	116	236	-25
Union Twp West	362	88	110	241	-22
Subtotal	5269	1285	1718	3403	-433

In these 12 precincts, Bush got 5269 votes (80.00%), and Kerry got 1285 votes (19.50%). Moyer got 3403 votes (66.45%), and Connally got 1718 votes (33.55%). These numbers cannot be right. There is no way that John Kerry got 433 fewer votes than Ellen Connally, in a presidential contest that drew 1469 more votes than the Chief Justice race. County wide, the disparity was 543 votes. This indicates a shift of at least 400 votes, and perhaps as many as 550 votes, from Kerry to Bush, resulting in a net loss of 800 to 1100 votes for John Kerry.

Five precincts appear on both lists: Blanchard Township, Jennings Township West, Ottawa Township West, Palmer Township, and Pleasant Township North. In these 5 precincts, Kerry got 203 fewer votes than Connally, and 28 fewer votes than Gore and Nader combined.

Also in Putnam County, Bush ran within 301 votes (2.05%) of Voinovich, his second closest showing in the state. Kerry received fewer votes than Ben Neinberg, the losing Democratic candidate for the Ohio State Legislature. Neinberg lost the district with 30.81% of the vote, and Putnam County with 37.91% of the vote. And, as stated above, Putnam County was one of only three counties in Ohio where Kerry ran behind not only Ellen Connally, but the two losing candidates for Associate Justice as well.

COMPARISON OF PUTNAM COUNTY RESULTS, 2004

Office	Republican	Democrat	Others
President of the United States	14,370	4,392	87
Ohio State Representative	11,322	6,914	0

The website of J. Kenneth Blackwell reveals another interesting anomaly as well. Elections were held for two positions on the Court of Appeals, District Number 3. There are 17 counties in the district. Both Richard Rogers and Stephen R. Shaw ran unopposed. Rogers got 221,763 votes in the other 16 counties, and zero votes in Putnam County. Shaw got 216,380 votes in the other 16 counties, and zero votes in Putnam County. This is confirmed by the precinct canvass.

The website of the Green Party contains the following passage:

"When I first called them, they had stated that their board would meet on December 15 to schedule their recount, but when contacted on December 15 to determine the results of that meeting, they stated that the recount had been conducted and completed that day. I got a little huffy with them on the phone."

http://www.iwantmyvote.org/recount/ohio_reports/counties/putnam.php

So far as I know, Putnam County was the only one of 88 counties in Ohio that conducted its "recount" without witnesses.

SUMMARY

County	Net Loss for Kerry
Shelby	3,000
Brown	800 - 1,300
Auglaize	2,800 - 3,500
Van Wert	1,400
Darke	1,700 - 2,400
Mercer	2,400 - 3,600
Putnam	800 - 1,100
Total	12,900 - 16,300